

Planning & Development Division

Planning & Economic Development Department

218-730-5580

D plar

] planning@duluthmn.gov

Room 160 411 West First Street Duluth, Minnesota 55802

File Number	PLUMA-2503-0003		Contact Natalie Lavenstein		ein, nlavenstein@duluthmn.gov	
Туре	UDC Map Amendment-R-1 to R-P		Planning Commission Date		June 10, 2025	
Deadline for Action	Application Date		May 16, 202	5 60 Days	July 15, 2025	
	Date Extension Letter Mailed		May 16, 2025	5 120 Days	September 13, 2025	
Location of Subject		3901 E Superior St				
Applicant	SAS+ Associates		Contact	Luke Sydow		
Agent	Northland Country Club		Contact	Fony Yung		
Legal Description		010-2710-03550, 010-2710-03500, 010-3275-00032				
Site Visit Date		May 29, 2025	Sign Notice Date		May 26, 2025	
Neighbor Letter Date		May 19, 2025	Number of Letters Sent		42	

Proposal

Applicant is requesting a UDC Map Amendment (rezoning) from R-1 to Residential-Planned (R-P) to construct 11 two family homes (22 units total), 4 lots for single family homes (4 units total), and 2 bed and breakfast sites (4 units total).

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission recommend approval of the rezoning amendment to the City Council (via ordinance).

	Current Zoning	Existing Land Use	Future Land Use Map Designation
Subject	R-1	Golf Course	Open Space, Traditional Neighborhood
North	R-1	Gold Course	Open Space
South	R-1	Residential	Traditional Neighborhood
East	R-1	Country Club	Open Space
West	P-1	Residential/ Church	Traditional Neighborhood

Summary of Code Requirements

- UDC Sec. 50-14.7.E: The establishment of an R-P district requires rezoning the property per Section 50-37.3 from a current zone district to R-P and the approval of an R-P regulating plan per Section 50-37.11. that governs the uses, location, density, dimensional standards and character of the proposed project.
- UDC Sec. 50-37.3.C: The Planning Commission shall review the application, and Council shall approve the application or approve it with modifications, if it determines that the application: 1. Is consistent with the Comprehensive Land Use Plan; 2. Is reasonably related to the overall needs of the community, to existing land use, or to a plan for future land use; 3. Is required by public necessity, convenience, or general welfare, or good zoning practice; 4. Will not create material adverse impacts on nearby properties, or if material adverse impacts may be created they will be mitigated to the extent reasonably possible.

Comprehensive Plan Governing Principle and/or Policies and Current History (if applicable): <u>Governing Principles</u>

Governing Principle #8 – Encourage mix of activities, uses, and densities.

Cities have evolved to be a mix of land uses, building types and housing types that is an ever-constant balance for neighborhoods and the City as a whole. R-P rezonings allow for an expansion of uses and buildings with process to protect against development that is out of character with the area.

Future Land Use

Open Space: High natural resource or scenic value, with substantial restrictions and development limitations.

Traditional Neighborhood: Characterized by grid or connected street pattern, houses oriented with shorter dimensions to the street and detached garages, some with alleys.

<u>History</u>

The parcels contain an existing sport court and accessory buildings to support Northland County Club amenities.

Review and Discussion Items:

Staff finds that:

- 1. The subject property incorporates a total of 13.4 acres. The area is currently zoned R-1 (Residential-Traditional). Applicant proposes rezoning to Residential-Planned (R-P). The R-1 district is identified in Table 50-14.7-2 as eligible to be rezoned to R-P.
- 2. As part of the Map Amendment process, an R-P plan identifying uses, density, and height is required. A total of 4.8 acres of the applicant's property is identified as residential area with a proposed density of 5 units per acre. The applicant proposes a maximum of 26 residential units. Another 6.4 acres of the applicant's property is identified as common open space.
- 3. As indicated in the attached memo, the applicant's proposal would allow single-family and two-family homes. Also included in the attached memo is a proposal for Bed & Breakfast sites. These sites will require special use permits prior to operating.
- 4. The applicant is not requesting an increase in the allowed maximum building height in the underlying R-1 standard as permitted in Table 50-14.7-1.
- 5. The R-P district requires a minimum of 30% of the area be kept in open space and 66% of the remaining area (excluding common open space) for residential purposes; applicant is proposing 6.4 acres as common open space, 4.8 acres as residential, and 1.2 acres of commercial. The remaining one acre is for streets and infrastructure.
- 6. An R-P district requires a level of public benefit that exceeds what would be required in the underlying zone district. As shown in the attached memo, the applicant proposes the following three public benefits: 1) Preservation of Natural Resources and Undeveloped Areas: More compact two-family dwellings allow for clustered development, thereby preserving a larger contiguous tract of land. Approximately 4.2 acres directly adjacent to the 40th Ave Creek will be kept in preservation; this allows for creek, trees, and wildlife habitat to be maintained in its current state. 2) A Higher Level of Sustainability: Standards will be set to ensure this development achieves higher sustainability than otherwise required; staff recommends a minimum of 4 points in accordance with Sec. 50-29. 3) More Efficient & Effective Use of Streets: By extending an existing developed area to create single and two-family residential opportunities, there will be less environmental impact, utility work and road construction necessary to achieve development. Keeping the new access road to the proposed homes as a private street will eliminate the need for City plow and maintenance services.
- 7. As adopted with the comprehensive plan (Imagine Duluth 2035), the Future Land Use for the area is primarily Open Space with some areas as Traditional Neighborhood. The Open Space designation is a reflection of the property's long-standing use as a golf course. Staff finds it reasonable for a golf course to include adjacent housing. The establishment of common open space meets the goals of the Open Space designation by substantially restricting development of areas with high natural resource value. This proposed R-P district implements the future land uses, development goals, and natural resource preservation goals of the comprehensive plan.
- 8. A public meeting is required in advance of an application for a UDC Map Amendment to R-P. A meeting was held on Monday, April 29, 2024, with 26 people in attendance. Attached is an outline of the discussion topics from the meeting. The applicant was strongly encouraged to host an additional public meeting due to the time between the public meeting and application. However, the single meeting does meet the requirements of Sec. 50-14.G.
- 9. No public, City, or agency comments have been received.
- 10. This amendment will not create material adverse impacts on nearby properties due to the requirements contained in City ordinances such as stormwater, landscaping and buffering, shielding of exterior lighting, screening of trash and mechanical equipment, and the establishment of a vegetated buffer surrounding the site.
- 11. The development must receive approval of a regulating plan in accordance with Sec 50-14.7.H and follow all applicable building and fire code standards and other regulations related to life safety.

Staff Recommendation:

Based on the above findings, staff recommends to Planning Commission that the proposed amendment to change the building, lot configuration, and use of the R-P Regulating Plan as depicted in the attached Exhibits be recommended for approval by City Council for the following reasons:

- 1) This proposal is consistent with the Comprehensive Land Use Plan.
- 2) The proposed R-P District is reasonably related to the overall needs of the community and to existing land use.
- 3) Material adverse impacts on nearby properties are not anticipated or will be mitigated.



Legend

Zoning BoundariesRoad or Alley ROWCounty Parcel Data

Zoning

UDC Zoning



RezoneArea

The City of Duluth has tried to ensure that the information contained in this map or electronic document is accurate. The City of Duluth makes no warranty or guarantee concerning the accuracy or reliability. This drawing/data is neither a legally recorded map nor a survey and is not intended to be used as one. The drawing/data is a compilation of records, information and data located in various City, County and State offices and other sources affecting the area shown and is to be used for reference pupposes only. The City of Duluth shall not be liable for errors contained within this data provided or for any damages in connection with the use of this information contained within.



AREA TO BE REZONED (7.5 ACRES)

NORTHLAND COUNTRY CLUB PROPERTY LINE

24

LEGAL DESCRIPTION PARCEL I.D. - 010-2710-03500

CITY OF DULUTH SECTION 12 TOWNSHIP 50

RANGE 14

NE $\frac{1}{4}$ OF SE $\frac{1}{4}$ EX 5 17/100

NORTHLAND COUNTRY CLUB



ASSOCIATES VWW.SASLANDARCH.COM 219 WEST FIRST STREET, SUITE 350 DULUTH, MN 55802 (P) 218.391.1335				
MAIL@SASLANDARCH.CO COPYRIGHT 2025 ALL DRAWN INFORMATION APPEARING HER DUPLICATED, DISCLOSED OR 0	AND WRITTEN EIN SHALL NOT BE			
SAS+ASSOCIATES.				
NORTHLAND COUNTRY CLUB	3901 E. SUPERIOR ST. DULUTH, MINNESOTA			
	120'			
Sheet Key Sheet Title REZONING MAP Date: <u>3/14/2025</u> Drawn By: <u>LWS</u>				
CHECKED BY: LWS PROJECT NUMBER	0			



y 14, 2025 - 2:34pm 7200 - NCC Holappa\B20 - NCC Development Graphic



MEMO

PROJECT:	Northland Country Club (NCC) Re-Zoning
PROJECT #:	17200
TOPIC:	R-P Re-Zoning Documentation
DATE:	14 May 2025
FROM:	SAS+ Associates
TO:	City of Duluth
cc:	Northland Country Club

PROJECT NARRATIVE

REQUESTED ACTION: RE-ZONE FROM R-1 to R-P

SITE DESCRIPTION

Total Site Area Minimum Common Open Space Required (30% of Site Area) Proposed Common Open Space Site Area

Residential Site Area Proposed Density- Units/ Acre of Residential Area Proposed Density- Units/ Acre of Total Site

Bed and Breakfast Site Area

SITE USES (as permitted per UDC Table 50-19.8)

- Dwelling, Single Family

- Dwelling, Two Family

- Lodging (Commercial), Bed and Breakfast

NARRATIVE OF PUBLIC BENEFITS

The proposed change to R-P zoning will benefit the public in several ways, as outlined below (Numbers refer to City of Duluth UDC 50-14.7.C 'Modifications'):

- 1. Preservation of Natural Resources and Undeveloped Areas
 - More compact two-family dwellings allow for clustered development, thereby the opportunity to preserve a larger contiguous tract of land.
 - Approximately 4.2 acres directly adjacent to the 40th Ave Creek will be kept in preservation; this allows for wetland/ creek, trees, and wildlife habitat to be maintained in its current state.
- 2. A Higher Level of Sustainability
 - Through the Regulating Plan (UDC 50-14.7-H.2), standards will be set to insure this development achieves a minimum of 4 points in accordance with UDC Section 50-29.

4.8 acres (69% of non-Open Space) 5 per acre (maximum 26 units) 2 per acre

1.2 acres

13.4 acres

6.4 acres (48%)

4.0 acres



This will be accomplished through Location, Energy Efficiency, Alternative Energy, Stormwater Retention, Vegetation and/ or Transportation intentional design practices.

- 3. More Efficient & Effective Use of Streets
 - By extending an existing developed area to create single and two-family residential opportunities, there will be less environmental impact, utility work and road construction necessary to achieve development. Keeping the new access road to the proposed homes as a private street will eliminate the need for City plow and maintenance services as well.
- 4. Recreational Facilities & Mass Transit
 - This development will provide pedestrian access through the residential area, existing Club facilities, and out to Superior Street where a City of Duluth bus stop and sidewalk are present.
 - The pedestrian access (details of which will be laid out in the Regulating Plan) will be used by residents, Club members, employees and guests of the Club.
- 7. Pedestrian Services
 - To further enhance the development and create inviting spaces for residents, members, and guests, benches and pedestrian-scaled, dark sky-friendly lighting will be provided.
- *8. Public Water Line Easement/ Installation
 - While this is not categorized in one of the seven public benefit 'modifications', NCC has, as part of this potential development, allowed the City of Duluth to install a 12" water main through NCC property in order to create a secondary service line to thousands of Lakeside residents, businesses and schools. This easement/ water line truly serves as a public benefit that hopefully will be taken into consideration as an additional R-P benefit, as was discussed with City of Duluth Engineering staff during the early stages of this R-P process.

END OF MEMO

Required community meeting.

The applicant shall hold at least one community meeting to discuss the plan before submitting the rezoning application for review and approval by the city. Notice of the public meeting shall be mailed to all property owners within 350 feet outside the planning area boundaries, and the city shall provide the applicant with the names and address of those property owners upon request.

The applicant shall submit with the application documentation that the community meeting has taken place, the date and time of the meeting, the number of attendees, any issues raised regarding the plan and any responses to those concerns incorporated in the plan;

NCC Community Meeting on rezoning:

4/29/24 - NCC Ballroom of Clubhouse

5:00pm

Number of attendees: 45 20

Issues Raises by attendees:

Responses to Concerns:

es: UTILity Q.? Type of properties? is pinewood law on the map? - no will Golf Cont? travel on the New Pord ? will the maintenance Bidg be resuld? Time (inte of city water-main to cake side? A:2.5 YIS ADO - Club Approached by the city Ave there height restricts on Any building? A: YET - 35 PT (not to Exceed) Type of Dupler A: 1100 Sd. FT per sine HOA ? A: YES, under one unballA cry with line Time line? * MEETING Disrupted by A MEMber, Sounding dignatical From past meetings Q: where does the water line enter the property? - seperate from Any (And development - Brd & pine wood (Right of WAY) No plan has been approved by the membership at this time. A thank you for holding this information are net g. Q: who would own the (Ard?

A: The land that & House on writ sits on only Q: when would the coty complete the water-cine A: if member approved, the coty would complete envly 2025 Q: what are the pister of the water line A: USING HPE minimizes bushy for many yours Q: what impact on NEWby Neighbor, View, cight pollution? A: possible view of lot 122 in Front of Another Home A: street lights not REQuired Q: Bedrock? A: A TEST dvilling will need to be done A: YES, very punuton - nembers must vote on development Q: CAN the plan be mixed 20NE? Q: Do you think members whote yes? A: to Endy to tell Q: Lots in/ be sold to areafons? Q; Does the strem on #3 weat Environ bel Approved A: NO, Not A designty test stream Q: water link open cut and then directionally drilled? A: Bedrock is present on the upper portion, not below Q: CLAVITY ON MEMber Loting process? A: 2 seperate votes a: date for votes? A: good is to be ready for members to ite on wate cim IN June, propety der. - CAte Sommen Or ANY special VANIANCES planned? A: The R-P Zowing will Heviste my need for variances