

## Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: Duluth Traverse Phase III – Enger & Central Park

Company Name: Rock Solid Trail Contracting

Company contact: Aaron Rogers

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

PTBA Member or Equivalent Experience	Yes <u>X</u> No <u>    </u>	- experience
Work Plan	<u>25</u> / <u>25</u>	- good description
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>20</u> / <u>20</u>	- well rounded experience
Understanding of the project scope	<u>15</u> / <u>15</u>	- good understanding of terrain
Completeness of the proposal	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>	
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>	- happy with their previous work
Project costs/fees	<u>18</u> / <u>20</u>	- high but within our budget
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>98</b> / <b>100</b>	

Date: 07/01/2015

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. Kathy Bergen

2. Judy Gibbs

3. Jim Shoberg

## Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: Duluth Traverse Phase III – Enger & Central Park

Company Name: Rock Solid Trail Contracting

Company contact: Aaron Rogers

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

PTBA Member or Equivalent Experience	Yes <u>X</u> No <u>    </u>
Work Plan	<u>25</u> / <u>25</u> seems to have solid understanding
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>20</u> / <u>20</u> have worked our rocky trail environments
Understanding of the project scope	<u>15</u> / <u>15</u>
Completeness of the proposal	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u> excellent track record
Project costs/fees	<u>20</u> / <u>20</u> seems to be in line with actual costs
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>100</b> / <b>100</b>

Date: 07/01/2015

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. Kathy Bergen

2. Judy Gibbs

3. Jim Shoberg

## Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: Duluth Traverse Phase III – Enger & Central Park

Company Name: Rock Solid Trail Contracting

Company contact: Aaron Rogers

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

PTBA Member or Equivalent Experience	Yes <u>X</u> No <u>  </u>	
Work Plan	<u>25</u> / <u>25</u>	detailed w/ the tools needed for rock work
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>15</u> / <u>20</u>	rock experience shown in work plan
Understanding of the project scope	<u>15</u> / <u>15</u>	new team understands rock construction
Completeness of the proposal	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>	
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>	good record w/ city
Project costs/fees	<u>20</u> / <u>20</u>	was w/in budget of our scope
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>95</b> / <b>100</b>	

Date: 07/01/2015

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. Kathy Bergen

2. Judy Gibbs

3. Jim Shoberg

## Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: Duluth Traverse Phase III – Enger & Central Park

Company Name: Trail Source

Company contact: Timothy Wegner

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

PTBA Member or Equivalent Experience	Yes <u>X</u> No <u>   </u>	PTBA Member
Work Plan	<u>15</u> / <u>25</u>	-minimal
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>15</u> / <u>20</u>	-some variety but none with rocks
Understanding of the project scope	<u>12</u> / <u>15</u>	-seems to be missing understanding of Duluth terrain
Completeness of the proposal	<u>9</u> / <u>10</u>	-we needed to obtain unit prices on erosion blankets if we hire them
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>none</u> / <u>10</u>	
Project costs/fees	<u>15</u> / <u>20</u>	-seems to low from other Duluth projects
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>66</b> / <b>100</b>	

Date: 07/01/2015

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. Kathy Bergen

2. Judy Gibbs

3. Jim Shoberg

## Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: Duluth Traverse Phase III – Enger & Central Park

Company Name: Trail Source

Company contact: Timothy Wegner

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

PTBA Member or Equivalent Experience	Yes <u>X</u> No <u>    </u>	PTBA Member
Work Plan	<u>20</u> / <u>25</u>	not much description as to implementation and strategy
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>18</u> / <u>20</u>	seems qualified in general but not rock work?
Understanding of the project scope	<u>12</u> / <u>15</u>	doesn't seem to understand the rocky nature?
Completeness of the proposal	<u>9</u> / <u>10</u>	no unit prices – but – bid sheet is confusing
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>0-NA</u> / <u>10</u>	
Project costs/fees	<u>10</u> / <u>20</u>	costs seem too low, especially mobilization costs
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>69</b> / <b>100</b>	

Date: 07/01/2015

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. Kathy Bergen

2. Judy Gibbs

3. Jim Shoberg

## Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: Duluth Traverse Phase III – Enger & Central Park

Company Name: Trail Source

Company contact: Timothy Wegner

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

PTBA Member or Equivalent Experience	Yes <u>X</u> No <u>    </u>	PTBA Member
Work Plan	<u>20</u> / <u>25</u>	not much detail
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>10</u> / <u>20</u>	no mention of experience in rock work
Understanding of the project scope	<u>10</u> / <u>15</u>	bid was very low, may not understand magnitude or rock work
Completeness of the proposal	<u>5</u> / <u>10</u>	missing costs for erosion control items
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>-</u> / <u>10</u>	n/a
Project costs/fees	<u>20</u> / <u>20</u>	was low
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>65</b> / <b>100</b>	

Date: 07/01/2015

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. Kathy Bergen

2. Judy Gibbs

3. Jim Shoberg