

Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: St. Louis River Corridor Neighborhood Parks MNB

Company Name: SAS

Company contact: Luke Sidow

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

Work Plan	<u>20</u>	/	<u>25</u>
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>15</u>	/	<u>20</u>
Understanding of the project scope	<u>10</u>	/	<u>15</u>
Completeness of the proposal	<u>5</u>	/	<u>10</u>
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>5</u>	/	<u>10</u>
Project costs/fees	<u>20</u>	/	<u>20</u>
TOTAL	<u>75</u>	/	<u>100</u>

Date: 6/24/15

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. KATHY BERGEN
2. CHUCK CAMPBELL
3. LISA LUDKANA

Notes:

- Proposal was thin on work plan and project scope and ideas for applied methodology to engage community members in input process, did not meet scope.
- Personnel expertise was limited/ Size/scope of project team.
- Pending projects completion on other parks projects

Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: St. Louis River Corridor Neighborhood Parks NMPs
 Company Name: SRF/LHB
 Company contact: Heidi Bringman - LHB

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

Work Plan	<u>20</u> / <u>25</u>
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>20</u> / <u>20</u>
Understanding of the project scope	<u>15</u> / <u>15</u>
Completeness of the proposal	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>10</u> / <u>10</u>
Project costs/fees	<u>10</u> / <u>20</u>
TOTAL	<u>85</u> / <u>100</u>

Date: 6/24/15

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. KATHY BERGEN
2. CHUCK CAMPBELL
3. LISA LUOKKA-CA

Notes:

- Question/Concern of Parks inventories being spread out over winter months.
- Timeline is only expedited if we omit the contingency
- Cost Prohibitive, particularly with any additional meetings and/or contingency

Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: St. Louis River Corridor Neighborhood Parks MAPs
Company Name: Confluence / BAER
Company contact: Terry Minarik

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

Work Plan	<u>20</u>	/	<u>25</u>
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>20</u>	/	<u>20</u>
Understanding of the project scope	<u>15</u>	/	<u>15</u>
Completeness of the proposal	<u>10</u>	/	<u>10</u>
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>10</u>	/	<u>10</u>
Project costs/fees	<u>5</u>	/	<u>20</u>
TOTAL	<u>80</u>	/	<u>100</u>

Date: 6/24/15

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. KATHY BERGEN
2. CHUCK CAMPBELL
3. LISA LUOKKANEN

Notes:

- Work plan leaned too heavily on City staff facilitation/public process.
- Project cost fees not reflective of typical scope of work for Duluth Parks System.

Proposal Final Evaluation

Name of RFP/project: St. Louis River Corridor Neighborhood Park MNP

Company Name: HKGi

Company contact: Lil Leatham

Proposals reviewed by City Staff will award based upon qualifications as described below. A 100-point scale will be used to create the final evaluation recommendations.

Work Plan	<u>20</u>	/	<u>25</u>
Qualifications/experience of the personnel and company	<u>20</u>	/	<u>20</u>
Understanding of the project scope	<u>15</u>	/	<u>15</u>
Completeness of the proposal	<u>10</u>	/	<u>10</u>
History (completeness & timeliness) of past work with City of Duluth	<u>10</u>	/	<u>10</u>
Project costs/fees	<u>15</u>	/	<u>20</u>
TOTAL	<u>90</u>	/	<u>100</u>

Date: 6/24/15

Name of Review Committee Members:

1. KATHY BERGEN

2. CHUCK CAMPBELL

3. LISA LUOKKALA

Notes:

- Work Plan met majority of Scope
- Understanding of project clearly conveyed
- Qualification of team met expectations and demand of project - particularly public process.
- Fees within range of estimated cost